

I-195 REDEVELOPMENT DISTRICT COMMISSION

MEETING OF COMMISSION

PUBLIC SESSION

JULY 19, 2023

The I-195 Redevelopment District (the "District") Commission (the "Commission") met on Wednesday, July 19, 2023, in Public Session, beginning at 5:00 P.M., at District Hall, located at 225 Dyer Street, Second Floor, Providence, Rhode Island pursuant to a notice of the meeting to all Commissioners and public notice of the meeting, a copy of which is attached hereto, as required by applicable Rhode Island law.

The following Commissioners were present and participated throughout the meeting: Chairperson Marc Crisafulli, Mr. Michael McNally, Mr. Robert McCann, Mr. Vincent Masino, and ex-officio board members Mr. Joseph Mulligan and Ms. Liz Tanner.

Not present were Commissioners Ms. Sandra Smith and Dr. Barrett Bready.

Also, present were Ms. Caroline Skuncik, District Executive Director, Ms. Amber Ilcisko, District Director of Operations, Mr. Peter Erhartic, District Director of Real Estate, Ms. Sarina Conn, District Office Manager, and Mr. Charles F. Rogers of Locke Lord, LLP, legal counsel to the District.

1. WELCOMING REMARKS BY CHAIRPERSON CRISAFULLI.

Chairperson Crisafulli called the meeting to order at 5:04 P.M.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT SESSION.

No members of the public signed up to speak during public comment session.

3. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETINGS HELD ON MAY 17, 2023.

Chairperson Crisafulli stated that the minutes of the May 17, 2023, meetings had been distributed to the Commissioners and asked if there were any comments or corrections.

There being none, upon motion made by Mr. McCann and seconded by Mr. McNally, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: To approve the minutes of the of the Commission meetings held on July 19, 2023.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Mr. McCann, Mr. McNally, and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

4. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

Ms. Skuncik provided an update on the proposed development projects. She stated that a ceremonial ribbon cutting was held for Parcel 6 and that phase one of the Parcel 9 development closed and construction commenced the following day. She noted a groundbreaking event would be held the following week for the Parcel 9 project. Ms. Skuncik also stated that the construction team had mobilized for the proposed lab project on Lot 3 of Parcel 25 and that a request for proposals had been issued for Parcel 1a. Ms. Skunick's report continued with an update on activities in 195 District Park, including the announcement of a partnership between the Isle Brewers Guild and Seven Stars Bakery as the operators for the future park pavilion. She stated that the construction of the Riverwalk extension was near completion and provided updates on programming in the Park, noting that 130 events are on this year's calendar, including large events like Pride.

Discussion continued on praise for the Park.

5. PRESENTATION BY HR&A REGARDING PRELIMINARY RECOMMENDATIONS ON A STRATEGY UPDATE FOR THE DISTRICT.

Ms. Skuncik summarized the scope of work for the study underway with HR&A to update the strategic plan of the District and introduced Kate Wittels of HR&A. Ms. Wittels used a Power Point presentation to present preliminary recommendations on the strategy update to the 2016 study completed for the I-195 Redevelopment District. The presentation included information about HR&A, what makes successful innovation districts, innovation district timelines, an overview of the 2016 study, the status of recommendations from the 2016 study, infrastructure and public amenities, a development summary, market conditions, residential market conditions, life sciences, development summary of life sciences, and recommendations. Recommendations included the promotion of the development of research space, to continue collaboration with Rhode Island Commerce, to support residential development in the District, District activation, and to create a cohesive district.

Discussion continued on the process to develop the report, life science company maturity, and the location of the proposed transit hub.

6. PRESENTATION REGARDING THE UPDATES TO THE APPLICATION BY URBANICA, INC. FOR CONCEPT DESIGN APPROVAL FOR THE PROPOSED MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT ON PARCEL 2.

Ms. Skuncik provided an overview on the proposed project on Parcel 2 and the process to date. She explained that Urbanica, Inc. was selected as preferred developer after a Request for Proposals (RFP) that took place over approximately six months and that Urbanica received the most favorable comments from the public. She reviewed the conditions outlined in the resolution selecting Urbanica as preferred developer with an update on the status of each item, including the parking study, traffic study, archaeological review, interface, coordination with the design review panel, a shadow study, review with neighborhood design representative designees, review

with the State Historic Preservation Officer, review with the Rhode Island Historical Preservation and Heritage Commission, and obtain approval from the State Historical Preservation Officer.

Ms. Skuncik then introduced Stephen Chung of Urbanica, Inc. who introduced Kamran Zahedi of Urbanica, Inc. and Kyle Zick of Kyle Zick Landscape Architecture. Mr. Chung used a Power Point presentation to present the updates to the concept design for the proposed project on Parcel 2. The presentation included: concept design review comments on the site plan and public realms, massing and building expression, and façade design. The presentation continued with the current proposal site plan within larger context, the concept landscape plan presented by Mr. Zick, programs on the South Water Street terrace, the massing and building expressions, façade design, and ended with a review of shadow studies.

There was no further discussion.

7. PRESENTATION BY UTILE, INC. REGARDING THE UPDATES TO THE APPLICATION BY URBANICA, INC. FOR CONCEPT DESIGN APPROVAL FOR THE PROPOSED MIXED-USE PROJECT ON PARCEL 2.

Mr. Tim Love of Utile, Inc. presented Utile's analysis of Urbanica's updates to the concept design application for Parcel 2. Mr. Love reviewed the memorandum issued by Utile regarding an analysis of the updates to the concept design which noted the responsiveness of the development team and the positive attributes of the project from urban design and architectural perspectives. He stated that Utile and the design review panel recommended concept design approval. Mr. Love pointed out minor conditions outlined in the memorandum such as the need for further review of the landscape, and further development of the shingles and façade.

There was no further discussion.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT REGARDING UPDATES TO THE APPLICATION BY URBANICA, INC. FOR CONCEPT DESIGN APPROVAL FOR THE PROPOSED MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT ON PARCEL 2.

Chairperson Crisafulli called upon the designated neighborhood representatives to provide their comments first. Representatives from the Jewelry District Association, Fox Point Neighborhood Association, and Mile of History Association were present. Comments were in favor of the design and the project moving forward; concerns were relayed regarding the landscape design and the need for further refinement including consideration of the curvilinear of the bridge, sunflowers, and the amount of pavement.

Thirteen other members of the public elected to provide comment. Comments included concerns about the project's impacts on parking and traffic, the increase in rents and lack of housing availability, the impact of climate change, the lack of housing options, the need for housing to support commercial development, and the lack of housing displacing current residents. Comments were also in favor of the project and residential development, appreciation for the developer, the design, and the architect, the project's support on climate

change, the low parking ratio, and more access to transit. There was also a request for additional information such as the commercial development plan.

9. VOTE TO CONSIDER THE APPLICATION BY URBANICA, INC. FOR CONCEPT DESIGN APPROVAL FOR THE PROPOSED MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT ON PARCEL 2.

Chairperson Crisafulli stated that prior to the meeting the Commission received a letter from an attorney representing the Mile of History Association and that the Commission's legal counsel would be responding aggressively.

Chairperson Crisafulli then asked the Commissioners if they had any comments. There being none, he requested a vote to consider the application by Urbanica, Inc. for concept design approval.

There being no further discussion, upon motion made by Mr. McNally and seconded by Mr. McCann, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: That the resolution regarding Concept Plan Approval for Proposed Project on Parcel 2 (a copy of which had been circulated to the members and is attached hereto as Exhibit A), be, and it hereby, is adopted and approved.

Voting by in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Mr. Masino, Mr. McNally, and Mr. McCann.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

10. PRESENTATION BY ARCHITECTURE RESEARCH OFFICE REGARDING THE APPLICATION BY THE DISTRICT FOR CONCEPT DESIGN APPROVAL FOR THE PROPOSED PARK PAVILION TO BE LOCATED IN 195 DISTRICT PARK.

Ms. Skuncik used a Power Point presentation to provide background on the proposed park pavilion to be located in 195 District Park including pavilion precedents and a summary of community engagement to date.

She then introduced Kim Yao of Architecture Research Office (ARO). Ms. Yao used a Power Point presentation to present the concept design for the proposed park pavilion. The presentation included site drivers, community engagement events and the activity board response keywords and site walk, site constraints, activation of the plaza and park zones, park pavilion siting, project principles, proposed concept design, site plan, orientation, porous edge, the park pavilion plan, conceptual material palette, and views and renderings.

Discussion continued on winter use and outdoor space and green roof maintenance.

11. PRESENTATION BY UTILE, INC. REGARDING THE APPLICATION BY THE DISTRICT FOR CONCEPT DESIGN APPROVAL FOR THE PROPOSED PARK PAVILION TO BE LOCATED IN 195 DISTRICT PARK.

Tim Love of Utile, Inc. reviewed the memorandum of the design analysis submitted by Utile and the design review panel. He summarized key points including that the siting of the building is smart and serves as a screen of the transformer yard and enhances the event lawn. Mr. Love added that the building was a nice background building with attractive indoor and outdoor spaces and that the paving treatments and ground planes were thoughtful.

Discussion continued on the importance of durable material choices and the requirement to corral to control alcohol service.

12. PUBLIC COMMENT REGARDING THE APPLICATION BY THE DISTRICT FOR CONCEPT DESIGN APPROVAL FOR THE PROPOSED PARK PAVILION TO BE LOCATED IN 195 DISTRICT PARK.

Chairperson Crisafulli called upon the designated neighborhood representatives to provide their comments first. Representatives from the Jewelry District Association, Fox Point Neighborhood Association, and Mile of History Association were present. Comments were complimentary of the concept design, materials, and architect. Suggestions were made to consider enhanced lighting options.

One other member of the public elected to provide comment. Her comments relayed concerns for ponding in the park and security.

13. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Chairperson Crisafulli stated that, pursuant to the notice of the meeting, the Commission would go into Executive Session for discussion regarding the purchase, sale, exchange, lease, or value of real property that would have a detrimental effect on the negotiating position of the Commission with the other parties if discussed in open session.

Accordingly, upon motion duly made by Mr. Masino and seconded by Mr. McCann the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: To go into Closed Session, pursuant to the Open Meetings Act, Rhode Island General Laws Section 42-46-5 (the Open Meetings Law) and 42-64.14.6(i) (the I-195 Act), in order to consider the purchase, sale, exchange, lease or value of District real estate.

Voting by in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Mr. McNally, Mr. McCann, and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

Commissioners and District staff then proceeded to enter into Closed Session at 7:12 P.M.

Ms. Tanner left the meeting at 7:12 P.M.

The Public Session was reconvened at 7:24 P.M.

Chairperson Crisafulli reported that discussion in the Executive Session was confined to review and discussion of proposals regarding the purchase and sale of District real estate and no votes were taken. Additionally, the Commission voted to end the Executive Session, maintain the Executive Session minutes, and reconvene the Public Session.

Upon motion duly made by Mr. Masino and seconded by Mr. McCann, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: That pursuant to Rhode Island General Laws Section 42-46-5(a), the Open Meetings Act, the minutes of the Closed Session shall not be made available to the public, except as to the portions of such minutes as the Commission ratifies and reports in Public Session of the meeting until disclosure would no longer jeopardize the Commission's negotiating positions.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Mr. Masino, Mr. McCann, and Mr. McNally.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

14. VOTE TO ENTER INTO A LEASE AGREEMENT WITH ISLE BREWERS GUILD FOR FOOD AND BEVERAGE OPERATIONS AT THE PARK PAVILION IN DISTRICT PARK.

Chairperson Crisafulli asked the Commissioners if they had any comments regarding the lease terms with the Isle Brewers Guild for food and beverage operations at the park pavilion in District Park.

There being no further discussion, upon motion made by Mr. McCann and seconded by Mr. McNally, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: That the Resolution regarding the proposed pavilion lease (a copy of which Resolution had been circulated to the members and is attached hereto as Exhibit B), be, and it hereby, is adopted and approved.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Mr. Masino, Mr. McNally, and Mr. McCann.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

15. VOTE TO ADJOURN.

There being no further discussion, upon motion made by Mr. Masino and seconded by Mr. McCann the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: That the meeting be adjourned.

Voting by in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Mr. McCann, Mr. McNally and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:27 P.M.



Marc Crisafulli, Chairperson

EXHIBIT A

I-195 REDEVELOPMENT DISTRICT

Resolution Re: Concept Plan Approval
For Proposed Project On Parcel 2

July 19, 2023

WHEREAS: The District has entered into a Purchase and Sale Agreement (the “Agreement”) with Collage Development LLC (“Collage”) dated October 20, 2022, as amended, pursuant to which the District has agreed to sell to Collage District Parcel 2; and

WHEREAS: The Commission has received an application (the “Application”) from Collage in accordance with the requirements of the District’s Development Plan (the “Development Plan”) for Concept Plan Approval of a Concept Plan for a proposed project consisting of two buildings ranging from three (3) to six (6) stories to be built on Parcel 2 to include (a) approximately 171 residential units; (b) approximately 8,300 square feet of retail/commercial space; and (c) subsurface parking (the “Proposed Project”); and

WHEREAS: The Commission’s design review panel has reviewed the Application and made certain recommendations to Collage, many of which Collage has incorporated into the Concept Plan; and

WHEREAS: At its meetings on May 17, 2023 and this date, the Commission received presentations by Collage and by Utile Design (“Utile”), the Commission’s design consultant, with respect to the Concept Plan for the Proposed Project; and

WHEREAS: The Commission invited comments from the neighborhood representatives and the public with respect to the Concept Plan for the Proposed Project and a number were offered; and

WHEREAS: Utile has recommended that the Concept Plan be approved, subject to certain conditions set forth in Utile’s letter to the Commission dated July 13, 2023; and

WHEREAS: The Commission, having considered the presentations of Collage and Utile with respect to the Concept Plan, has determined that Concept Plan satisfies the requirements for Concept Plan Approval as set forth in the Development Plan.

NOW, THEREFORE, it is:

VOTED: That the Commission approves the Concept Plan as submitted and hereby issues Concept Plan Approval to Collage, subject to and contingent upon the conditions set forth in Utile’s letter of July 13, 2023, a copy of which is

attached hereto as Exhibit A. No rights to proceed with the Proposed Project shall be treated as vested under this Concept Plan Approval.

EXHIBIT A

July 13, 2023

to better understand how the curvilinear geometry of the surface treatment of the landscape intersects with the orthogonal geometry of the buildings.

4. Additional study is required for landscape treatment of the plaza on the north end of the project (at James Street). Issues to study include the height and detailing of the trellis, and the landscaping treatment at the north and east edges of the plaza. These edge treatments should screen the cars in the adjacent parking lot and loading dock of the building on the opposite side of James Street, while not creating so much of an enclosure that occupants of the plaza feel too disconnected from the life of the sidewalk and views across the river.

Please do not hesitate to reach out if you have questions or would like additional information.

Regards,



Tim Love, Principal
Utile

utile

May 12, 2023

Caroline Skuncik, Executive Director
I-195 Redevelopment District Commission
225 Dyer Street, Fourth Floor,
Providence, RI 02903

utile

RE: Parcel 2 Concept Plan Design Review Comments

Design Review Panel Contributors:

- Craig Barton, Design Review Panel
- Emily Vogler, Design Review Panel
- Jack Ryan, Design Review Panel
- Peter Van Erp, Neighborhood Association Design Representative, Downtown Neighborhood Association
- Leslie Myers, Neighborhood Association Design Representative, Fox Point Neighborhood Association
- Lorenzo Apicella, Neighborhood Association Design Representative, The Jewelry District Association
- Jon-Paul (JP) Couture, Neighborhood Association Design Representative, Mile of History Association
- Tim Love, Utile
- Zoë Mueller, Utile

Dear Caroline,

Utile and the I-195 Redevelopment District Design Review Panel met on May 9th of 2023 to review Urbanica's revised massing and design concept for Phase 2 of their proposed mixed-use development on Parcel 2. The designated neighborhood association design representatives were invited to join this meeting and all that were not able to attend the meeting were included in a follow-up meeting to discuss and refine the design review feedback included in this memo, which was circulated via email for feedback prior to posting. The comments below are meant to inform potential revisions to the design prior to Concept and Final Plan Approval.

The overall design vision of the project has evolved considerably since the proposal stage. The new design vision is equally strong as the initial vision and is even more responsive to the unique site conditions and context. The development team has shown uncommon versatility, commitment, and willingness to listen to and respond to local stakeholder feedback on the project's design direction.

The resulting project has many irregular angular conditions that are responsive to the various easements and site constraints similar to local historic development patterns. This is generally positive in that it creates varied, contextually-sensitive moments that read as a composition of smaller individual buildings rather than a single monolithic building. However, there are moments that verge on being overworked or too busy. As part of the Design Review process, the Design Review Panel hopes to see the design team reduce the overall number of design moves in order to achieve a slightly more intentional and subtle composition in plan and in the massing and facade detailing and fenestration. Our expectation is that much of this will naturally get worked out through the refinement of the internal program configuration and unit layouts.

Architecture & Planning 115 Kingston St.
Boston, MA 02111
utiledesign.com

Site Plan & Public Realm

1. The complex site conditions have been handled well, and the more open-air treatment of the Transit Street gateway has great potential to capitalize on an existing intuitive pedestrian desire line and create varied experiences that are responsive to the unique lighting conditions throughout the day.
2. The extensive ground floor transparency is promising and well-placed to activate the public realm. However, it is critical that the programs identified for the residential amenity spaces provide sufficient activation. It will be important that those programs are further defined as the design progresses, especially for the program facing South Water Street.
3. The landscape strategy is promising but not fully resolved, which is to be expected at this stage of the project.
4. There are some accessibility details that need to be worked out as the public realm design advances. The primary curved accessible route to the plaza podium level would benefit from having some of the retaining wall carved away to improve its visibility and encourage intuitive navigation. The accessible route to the cafe space at the corner of James Street and South Water Street as well as the arcade that rises above it needs to be clarified.
5. The corner plaza at James Street and South Water Street should be further studied to determine if a cafe is the most effective program to activate the space.

Massing & Building Expression

1. The stepped massing response to the built fabric along James Street and the distinctive massing along Main and Water Street are effective.
2. The removal of the bridge over the Transit Street easement provides a clear view and allows the project to have a natural growth of scale from north to south.
3. The monumental quality of the ends of the building massing and facade treatment facing the internal plaza and James Street frontages is generally effective and the use of bay windows to punctuate these facades is promising.
4. The spatial definition of the corner plaza at James Street and South Water Street should be strengthened in order to hold the corner with more strength and confidence. The current scheme is overly deferential to the rear facade of the historic building.
5. The kink of the gray building volumes facing the courtyard and along South Main may be an example of where there is one move too many.

Facade Design

1. The multi-layered depth of facade and use of vertical piers works well.
2. The strength of the underlying facade logic needs to be carried to the few remaining large unresolved or underdeveloped facades (e.g., the monolithic rear facade of the five-story mass facing the river should be broken down or articulated in some way).
3. The piers would benefit from a more unified resolution at the top of the building. This could, for example, be addressed through a unified cornice line.
4. The asymmetrical bays and wood-paneled fenestration is engaging and promising, but the pattern of fenestration could be deployed in a more intentional way as the unit floor plans are developed.
5. The bay window approach is most effective when the bay stops shy of the top floor allowing for a stronger, more unified approach to the top of the building.
6. The James Street facades would benefit from a slightly simpler and more unified approach.

utile

Materiality

1. The hand-wrought texture introduced by the terracotta shingling system combined with wood and metal framing of the fenestration creates a depth and historically-conscious tactile quality that is responsive to the unique context of this parcel.
2. The use of two different colors of terracotta shingles is effective at breaking down the overall mass and creating distinctive atmospheres. It would be helpful to see an exploration of the degree to which this objective could be achieved with a more subtle shift in the texture via exposure and coursing instead of color.
3. It will be important to address the detailing of a shingle system early to resolve difficult transitions such as corners and how the shingled condition is mediated to meet the ground plane. This is particularly important because the multi-layer pier approach to the facade combined with the kinks in plan create many fine-grained corner conditions to resolve.
4. A close study of the final material color choices, including studying the performance of those colors at a distance in relationship to the context, will be an important step as the project advances through design development to construction drawings.

Please do not hesitate to reach out if you have questions or would like additional information.

Regards,



Tim Love, Principal
Utile
115 Kingston Street
Boston, MA 02111

utile

EXHIBIT B

I-195 REDEVELOPMENT DISTRICT

RESOLUTION REGARDING PAVILION LEASE

July 19, 2023

WHEREAS: The I-195 Redevelopment District (the "District") was created and exists as a public corporation, governmental agency and public instrumentality of the State of Rhode Island under Chapter 64.14 of Title 42 of the General Laws of Rhode Island, as amended (the "Act"); and

WHEREAS: The Act authorizes the District, acting through its Commission (the "Commission"), to enter into agreements for the lease of properties owned by the District for any consideration and upon such terms and conditions as the Commission shall determine; and

WHEREAS: The Commission proposes to enter into a lease with Isle Brewers Guild, LLC ("Guild") to fit-out and operate a restaurant in the pavilion to be constructed by the District in 195 District Park; and

WHEREAS: The Chairperson and Executive Director have briefed the Commissioners in Executive Session this date regarding negotiations with Guild and the terms of the proposed lease and have requested that they be authorized to complete negotiations and execute a lease agreement with Guild as provided herein.

NOW, THEREFORE, acting by and through its Commissioners, the District hereby resolves as follows:

RESOLVED:

1. That the District be, and it hereby is, authorized to enter into a Lease Agreement with Isle (the "Lease Agreement") on the terms contained in the "Summary of Terms of Pavilion Lease Agreement" attached hereto as Exhibit A.
2. That each of the Chairperson and Executive Director, acting singly, be and hereby is, authorized to execute the Lease Agreement on behalf of the District subject to such modifications as he or she in his or her discretion deems necessary and appropriate.

Exhibit A

**SUMMARY OF TERMS OF PAVILION LEASE AGREEMENT
WITH ISLE BREWERS GUILD**

JULY 19, 2023

1.	Tenant:	Isle Brewers Guild, LLC
2.	Use:	Full-service restaurant with ancillary take-out concession.
3.	Seven Stars Bakery License:	A portion of the Premises will be license by Tenant to be operated as a Seven Stars Bakery. If that license is terminated, Tenant will have the right of first refusal to replace that vendor.
4.	Premises:	Approximately 2,200 sq. ft. in the pavilion to be constructed in 195 District Park with adjacent outdoor seating area. A separate license agreement will be required for any events located outside of the Premises.
5.	Term:	Five (5) years with a five (5) year renewal option.
6.	Base Rent:	Years 1 – 3: \$500/month plus 8% of beer and 4% of food sales; Years 4 – 5: \$750/month plus 8.5% of beer and 4.25% of food sales; Years 6 – 8: \$1,000/month plus 8.75% of beer and 4.5% of food sales; Years 9 – 10: \$1,000/month plus 9% of beer and 4.5% of food sales. Catering sales will subject to the above beer/food sales.
7.	Rent Commencement Date:	The earlier of fit-out of the Premises or six (6) months after the Premises delivered to Tenant.
8.	Security Deposit:	\$7,000 (based on assumed monthly rent for first year).
9.	Tenant Improvement Allowance; District Scope of Work:	No Tenant improvement allowance. District to provide core and shell and all building systems.
10.	Hours of Operation:	A minimum of six (6) days a week/eight (8) hours per day/ twelve (12) months per year.

11.	Utilities:	Wastewater to be paid by District. All other utilities will be paid by Tenant.
12.	Maintenance of Building Systems:	District will be responsible for building exterior and building spaces outside of the Premises, landscaping and major building systems. Tenant will maintain cooking ventilation interior and exterior spaces within the Premises that are not part of the building structure and systems.